TOWN OF WHEATLAND BOARD OF ASSESSMENT REVIEW MINUTES May 23. 2023

Members present: Gary Hults, Tina Stevens, Karina Shumanski, and James Kirch

Members absent:

Also present: Michael Bonanza, Assessor

The Town of Wheatland Assessment Review Board met on Tuesday, May 23, 2023, at 4:00 p.m. to review and make decisions on grievance forms filed for 2023. Mr. Michael Bonanza, the Assessor, was available for any questions that the Board had regarding the complaints. Tina Stevens, as Chairman called the meeting to order.

The following properties were presented to the Board from the Assessor to correct assessment entries:

1) John Naugle Tax Account No. 187.14-2-21.1 7 Terra Vista Property Address: 7 Terra Vista Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$189,000 to \$174,000

2) Phyllis Morabito Tax Account No. 199.03-1-58
9805 Union Street Property Address: 9805 Union Street
Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$131,500 to \$125,300

3) Vitalli Kaban Tax Account No. 200.10-1-4.1
10 East Genesee Street Property Address: 10 East Genesee Street
Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$250,000 to \$219,000

4) Christopher Hines Tax Account No. 186.20-1-6
822 North Road Property Address: 822 North Road
Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$215,000 to \$210,400

5)	Steven Stein 946 South Road Caledonia, NY 14423	Tax Account No. 209.03-1-4 Property Address: Armstrong Road Assessed: \$10,800 to \$7,800
6)	Robin Allison 894 Scottsville Mumford Road Scottsville, NY 14546	Tax Account No. 199.03-1-14.2 Property Address: 894 Scottsville Mumford Rd Assessed: \$197,500 to \$176,500
7)	Timothy Massaro 1549 Scottsville Mumford Road Scottsville, NY 14546	Tax Account No. 198.04-1-18.13 Property Address: 1549 Scottsville Mumford Road Assessed: \$189,000 to \$174,000
8)	Mikel Brown 4867 River Road Scottsville, NY 14546	Tax Account No. 211.01-1-4 Property Address: 4687 River Road Assessed: \$364,700 to \$340,700
9)	Kevin Beyea 47 West Grenadier Road Scottsville, NY 14546	Tax Account No. 187.17-2-40 Property Address: 47 West Grenadier Road Veteran's Disability from 80% to 90%

The Assessor stated that these corrections are due to changes in assessment or exemptions not entered on the tentative roll.

Gary Hults made a motion to approve the corrections. The motion was seconded by James Kirch and unanimously passed.

Tina Stevens, Chairperson

The following grievances were presented to the board:

10) Gayle Gallo-Lipp Tax Account No. 200.38-1-28
Anthony Gallo Property Address: 50 Main Street.

5549 E. Henrietta Road Assessed: \$130,000 Rush, NY 14543 Requested: \$86,500

This was a mail in application. The Applicant included a letter detailing the repairs needed to be done to the house.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on market value. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – nay James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

11) Patti Schmitt Tax Account No. 187.18-2-22 460 North Road Property Address: 460 North Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$88,000

Assessed: \$88,000 Requested: \$75,000

This was a mail in application. The Applicant included comps and stated that the home has not had any renovations in the last 30 years.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on market value. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

12) Robert Sherman 1751 South Road Scottsville, NY 14546

Tax Account No. 209.04-1-16.2 Property Address: 1751 South Road

Assessed: \$156,400

Requested: left blank on form

This was a mail in application. The Applicant included a handwritten page of comps from similar homes in the area.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by j. Kirch and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

13) Paula Stoll 866 Scottsville Mumford Rd. Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 199.03-1-23

Property Address: 866 Scottsville Mumford Rd

Assessed: \$313,600 Requested: \$156,800

Mark Stoll was present to speak to the Board. His wife, who passed away recently, was the owner of the home. Mr. Stoll believes that the assessed value exceeds the value of the house. It is 5,000 square feet, but he only lives in a small portion of the house due to damage that has occurred. Due to a leaky roof. A tree recently fell on the house as well. He stated that he is having trouble finding someone to do the needed repairs.

T. Stevens made a motion to reduce the assessment to \$295,600 based on the condition of the property. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

14) Nick Pearl 9 Oakwood Lane Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 200.09-2-23 Property Address: 11 Main Street

Assessed: \$92,200 Requested: \$84,200

Mr. Pearl was present to speak to the Board. He stated that the lack of business on Main Street has caused a decline in his lunch business.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

15) David Spence 1224 Quaker Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 199.03-1-43.12 Property Address: 1224 Quaker Road

Assessed: \$176,000 Requested: \$160,000

This was a mailed in application with no additional evidence provided.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

16) David Spence 1224 Quaker Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 199.03-1-43.11 Property Address: 1220 Quaker Road

Assessed: \$71,600 Requested: \$64,600

This was a mailed in application with no additional evidence provided.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

17) Thomas Widell 1087 North Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 199.02-1-8

Property Address: 1087 North Road

Assessed: \$310,000 Requested: \$250,000

This was a mailed in application with some area comps provided.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

18) Lukas & Paige Brightman 53 Chili Avenue Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 199.08-1-34 Property Address: 53 Chili Avenue

Assessed: \$205,200 Requested: \$185,472

Lukas Brightman was present to speak to the Board. He stated that he bought his house for \$257,000 in 2021 and was aware he overpaid for the home. Their appraisal came in at \$20,000 lower than the purchase price.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

19) Frederick Arner FKA Enterprises, LLC 4147 O'Neil Road Livonia, NY 14487 Tax Account No. 200.38-1-11 Property Address: 16 Main Street

Assessed: \$200,000 Requested: \$150,000

Mr. Arner was present to speak to the Board. He brought pictures of his apartment building and a list of comparables. He stated that there are repairs and updates needed for the property which includes peeling paint, old carpets, old kitchen, vinyl floors and missing shingles.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on the market rate cap survey applied to the Net operating income calculation. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

20) Warren Halter 470 North Road Scottsville, NY 14546

Tax Account No. 187.18-2-20 Property Address: 470 North Rd

Assessed: \$109,900 Requested: \$89,900

Raymond Halter was present to speak to the Board due to the recent passing of his father Warren. He stated that the house needs many updates and repairs. He stated that the house next door, which was at one time assessed the same as his father's house, sold for 129,500 after the owners put \$40-\$50,000 into updates on the house. Mr. Halter stated that the garage needs support beams to hold it up. He also stated that it needs a new sewer line, new roof, and work done on the gas line for heat.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on the evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -recused Tina Stevens -aye

21) David Duford 42 Main St, Suite 1 Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 200.38-1-23.1 Property Address: 42 Main Street

Assessed: \$100,600 Requested: \$87,600

This was a mailed in application.

K. Shumanski made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

22) Helios Energy New York 4, LLC (a/k/a Wheatland 2A)
Henry Zomerfeld, Esq.
Hodgeson Russ, LLP
140 Pearl Street
Buffalo, NY 14202

Tax Account No. 199.03-1-4.1 Property Address: 1192 Scottsville Mumford Rd Assessed: \$3,127,027

Assessed: \$3,127,027 Requested: \$2,831,387

This was a mailed in application. The Assessor stated that the State controls the calculations for Solar farms. It was also noted that the owners of the land did not sign the paperwork, making this submission invalid.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on the evidence and the paperwork. The motion was seconded by G. Hults. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -recused Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

23) Ashley Kraska 58 W. Cavalier Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 200.05-2-47

Property Address: 58 W. Cavalier Road

Assessed: \$131,900 Requested: \$119,900

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

Zachary Lattuca2751 North RoadScottsville, NY 14546

Tax Account No. 197.04-1-6 Property Address: 2751 North Road

Assessed: \$170,000 Requested: \$155,000

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by K. Shumanski. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

25) Scott Lawler 18 Scott Crescent Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 200.09-2-37

Property Address: 18 Scott Crescent

Assessed: \$100,600 Requested: \$90,000

This was a mailed in application with some pictures of the interior of the home attached.

T. Stevens made a motion to lower the assessment to \$95,300 based on the evidence provided. The motion was seconded by K. Shumanski. and passed as follows:

26) Richard and Elizabeth Meyers Tax Account No. 200.38-1-20

10 Church Street Property Address: 10 Church Street Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$141,300

Assessed: \$141,300 Requested: \$130,000

This was a mailed in application. They stated that the roof is 20 years old, landscaping is deteriorated, there is no central air, and no interior upgrades. The neighboring house had a fire recently and has been vacant since.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by K. Shumanski. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

27) James Worden Tax Account No. 209.01-1-23

461 Armstrong Road Property Address: 461 Armstrong Road

Mumford, NY 14511 Assessed: \$96,000 Requested: \$90,000

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

28) Daria and Nate Dusett 4580 River Road Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 200.03-1-13.118 Property Address: 4580 River Road

Assessed: \$399,300 Requested: \$350,000

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

29) Terry Branton 31 North Cavalier Scottsville, NY 14546 Tax Account No. 187.17-2-56 Property Address: 31 North Cavalier

Assessed: \$131,700 Requested: \$119,700

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:

30) Erin Brunea Tax Account No. 208.04-1-14
Thomas Dysart Property Address: 20 Goodwin Circle

20 Goodwin Circle Assessed: \$171,700

Mumford, NY 14511 Requested: left blank on form

Ms. Brunea and Mr. Dysart were present to speak to the Board. They brought in a list of assessments for homes in their neighborhood. They believe that their home is assessed unfairly based on the neighboring homes.

G. Hults made a motion to lower the assessment to \$161,000 based comps. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:

Gary Hults – aye James Kirch -aye Karina Shumanski -aye Tina Stevens -aye

There being no further grievances, the meeting was adjourned at 8:27 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Renee Smith Recording Secretary