

**TOWN OF WHEATLAND**  
**BOARD OF ASSESSMENT REVIEW MINUTES**  
**May 23, 2023**

Members present: Gary Hults, Tina Stevens, Karina Shumanski, and James Kirch

Members absent:

Also present: Michael Bonanza, Assessor

The Town of Wheatland Assessment Review Board met on Tuesday, May 23, 2023, at 4:00 p.m. to review and make decisions on grievance forms filed for 2023. Mr. Michael Bonanza, the Assessor, was available for any questions that the Board had regarding the complaints. Tina Stevens, as Chairman called the meeting to order.

*The following properties were presented to the Board from the Assessor to correct assessment entries:*

- |    |  |  |
|----|--|--|
| 1) | John Naugle<br>7 Terra Vista<br>Scottsville, NY 14546            | Tax Account No. 187.14-2-21.1<br>Property Address: 7 Terra Vista<br>Assessed: \$189,000 to \$174,000         |
| 2) | Phyllis Morabito<br>9805 Union Street<br>Scottsville, NY 14546   | Tax Account No. 199.03-1-58<br>Property Address: 9805 Union Street<br>Assessed: \$131,500 to \$125,300       |
| 3) | Vitalli Kaban<br>10 East Genesee Street<br>Scottsville, NY 14546 | Tax Account No. 200.10-1-4.1<br>Property Address: 10 East Genesee Street<br>Assessed: \$250,000 to \$219,000 |
| 4) | Christopher Hines<br>822 North Road<br>Scottsville, NY 14546     | Tax Account No. 186.20-1-6<br>Property Address: 822 North Road<br>Assessed: \$215,000 to \$210,400           |

- 5) Steven Stein  
946 South Road  
Caledonia, NY 14423  
Tax Account No. 209.03-1-4  
Property Address: Armstrong Road  
Assessed: \$10,800 to \$7,800
- 6) Robin Allison  
894 Scottsville Mumford Road  
Scottsville, NY 14546  
Tax Account No. 199.03-1-14.2  
Property Address: 894 Scottsville Mumford Rd  
Assessed: \$197,500 to \$176,500
- 7) Timothy Massaro  
1549 Scottsville Mumford Road  
Scottsville, NY 14546  
Tax Account No. 198.04-1-18.13  
Property Address: 1549 Scottsville Mumford Road  
Assessed: \$189,000 to \$174,000
- 8) Mikel Brown  
4867 River Road  
Scottsville, NY 14546  
Tax Account No. 211.01-1-4  
Property Address: 4687 River Road  
Assessed: \$364,700 to \$340,700
- 9) Kevin Beyea  
47 West Grenadier Road  
Scottsville, NY 14546  
Tax Account No. 187.17-2-40  
Property Address: 47 West Grenadier Road  
Veteran's Disability from 80% to 90%

The Assessor stated that these corrections are due to changes in assessment or exemptions not entered on the tentative roll.

Gary Hults made a motion to approve the corrections. The motion was seconded by James Kirch and unanimously passed.

---

*Tina Stevens, Chairperson*

*The following grievances were presented to the board:*

10)	Gayle Gallo-Lipp	Tax Account No. 200.38-1-28
	Anthony Gallo	Property Address: 50 Main Street.
	5549 E. Henrietta Road	Assessed: \$130,000
	Rush, NY 14543	Requested: \$ 86,500

This was a mail in application. The Applicant included a letter detailing the repairs needed to be done to the house.

*T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on market value. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – nay  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*

11)	Patti Schmitt	Tax Account No. 187.18-2-22
	460 North Road	Property Address: 460 North Road
	Scottsville, NY 14546	Assessed: \$88,000
		Requested: \$75,000

This was a mail in application. The Applicant included comps and stated that the home has not had any renovations in the last 30 years.

*T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on market value. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*







- 18) Lukas & Paige Brightman      Tax Account No. 199.08-1-34  
53 Chili Avenue                      Property Address: 53 Chili Avenue  
Scottsville, NY 14546                Assessed: \$205,200  
   Requested: \$185,472

Lukas Brightman was present to speak to the Board. He stated that he bought his house for \$257,000 in 2021 and was aware he overpaid for the home. Their appraisal came in at \$20,000 lower than the purchase price.

*G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*

- 19) Frederick Arner                      Tax Account No. 200.38-1-11  
FKA Enterprises, LLC                      Property Address: 16 Main Street  
4147 O’Neil Road                              Assessed: \$200,000  
Livonia, NY 14487                              Requested: \$150,000

Mr. Arner was present to speak to the Board. He brought pictures of his apartment building and a list of comparables. He stated that there are repairs and updates needed for the property which includes peeling paint, old carpets, old kitchen, vinyl floors and missing shingles.

*G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on the market rate cap survey applied to the Net operating income calculation. The motion was seconded by T. Stevens. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*





- 22) Helios Energy New York 4, LLC      Tax Account No. 199.03-1-4.1  
(a/k/a Wheatland 2A)      Property Address: 1192 Scottsville Mumford Rd  
Henry Zomerfeld, Esq.      Assessed: \$3,127,027  
Hodgeson Russ, LLP      Requested: \$2,831,387  
140 Pearl Street  
Buffalo, NY 14202

This was a mailed in application. The Assessor stated that the State controls the calculations for Solar farms. It was also noted that the owners of the land did not sign the paperwork, making this submission invalid.

*T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on the evidence and the paperwork. The motion was seconded by G. Hults. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -recused  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*

- 23) Ashley Kraska      Tax Account No. 200.05-2-47  
58 W. Cavalier Road      Property Address: 58 W. Cavalier Road  
Scottsville, NY 14546      Assessed: \$131,900  
Requested: \$119,900

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

*T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*



26) Richard and Elizabeth Meyers Tax Account No. 200.38-1-20  
10 Church Street Property Address: 10 Church Street  
Scottsville, NY 14546 Assessed: \$141,300  
Requested: \$130,000

This was a mailed in application. They stated that the roof is 20 years old, landscaping is deteriorated, there is no central air, and no interior upgrades. The neighboring house had a fire recently and has been vacant since.

*G. Hults made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by K. Shumanski. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*

27) James Worden Tax Account No. 209.01-1-23  
461 Armstrong Road Property Address: 461 Armstrong Road  
Mumford, NY 14511 Assessed: \$96,000  
Requested: \$90,000

This was a mailed in application with no additional information provided.

*T. Stevens made a motion to uphold the assessment based on insufficient evidence. The motion was seconded by J. Kirch. and passed as follows:*

*Gary Hults – aye  
James Kirch -aye  
Karina Shumanski -aye  
Tina Stevens -aye*



